

## 'They prefer hidden treatment': anti-tuberculosis drug-taking practices and drug regulation in Karakalpakstan

Article (Accepted Version)

Stringer, Beverley, Lowton, Karen, Tillashaikhov, Mirzagalib, Parpieva, Nargiza, Ulmasova, Dilrabo, du Cros, Philipp, Hasker, Epcu and Sergeeva, Natasha (2016) 'They prefer hidden treatment': anti-tuberculosis drug-taking practices and drug regulation in Karakalpakstan. *International Journal of Tuberculosis and Lung Disease*, 20 (8). pp. 1084-1090. ISSN 1027-3719

This version is available from Sussex Research Online: <http://sro.sussex.ac.uk/id/eprint/62442/>

This document is made available in accordance with publisher policies and may differ from the published version or from the version of record. If you wish to cite this item you are advised to consult the publisher's version. Please see the URL above for details on accessing the published version.

### **Copyright and reuse:**

Sussex Research Online is a digital repository of the research output of the University.

Copyright and all moral rights to the version of the paper presented here belong to the individual author(s) and/or other copyright owners. To the extent reasonable and practicable, the material made available in SRO has been checked for eligibility before being made available.

Copies of full text items generally can be reproduced, displayed or performed and given to third parties in any format or medium for personal research or study, educational, or not-for-profit purposes without prior permission or charge, provided that the authors, title and full bibliographic details are credited, a hyperlink and/or URL is given for the original metadata page and the content is not changed in any way.

1 “They prefer hidden treatment”: tuberculosis drug-taking practices and drug regulation in  
2 Karakalpakstan

3

4 \*Beverley Stringer<sup>1</sup>, Karen Lowton<sup>2</sup>, Professor Mirzagalib Tillashaikhov<sup>3</sup>, Professor Nargiza  
5 Parpieva<sup>3</sup>, Dilrabo Ulmasova<sup>4</sup>, Philipp du Cros<sup>1</sup>, Epcó Hasker<sup>5</sup>, Natasha Sergeeva<sup>6</sup>

6

7 <sup>1</sup>Médecins Sans Frontières (MSF), London, UK; <sup>2</sup>Department of Sociology, University of

8 Sussex, London, UK, <sup>3</sup>Republican Specialized Scientific and Practical Medical Center of

9 Phthysiology and Pulmonology, Ministry of Health Uzbekistan, Tashkent, Uzbekistan;

10 <sup>4</sup>Ministry of Health of the Republic of Uzbekistan, Tashkent, Uzbekistan; <sup>5</sup>Institute of

11 Tropical Medicine, Antwerp, Belgium; <sup>6</sup>MSF, Tashkent, Uzbekistan; \*Corresponding author

12 Email: [beverley.stringer@london.msf.org](mailto:beverley.stringer@london.msf.org)

13 Beverley Stringer

14 Médecins Sans Frontières (MSF)

15 10 Furnival Street

16 London, EC4A 1AB

17 UK

18

19 Running head:

20 TB drug taking practices and regulation

21

22 Word count: 3474 main text, summary 200 words

23 1 panel, 2 boxes

24 Key words: MDR-TB, Uzbekistan, stigma, qualitative

25

26 **Summary**

27 **Setting**

28 The joint Médecins Sans Frontières/Ministry of Health multidrug-resistant tuberculosis  
29 (MDR-TB) programme; Karakalpakstan, Uzbekistan.

30 **Objective**

31 Uzbekistan has high rates of MDR-TB. We aimed to understand patients' and prescribers'  
32 attitudes to TB drug prescription, regulation, and drug-taking behaviour.

33 **Methods**

34 Participants (12 patients, 12 practitioners) were recruited purposively. Data were gathered  
35 qualitatively using field notes and in-depth interviews and analysed thematically.

36 **Findings**

37 Our analysis highlighted two main themes. First, shame and stigma were reported to increase  
38 the likelihood of self-treatment and incorrect use of TB drugs, most commonly at initial stages  
39 of illness. A health system failure to promote health information was perceived, leading to  
40 wrong diagnoses and inappropriate therapies. Motivated by shame, patients hid their  
41 condition by resorting to drug-treatment options outside the programme, compounding the  
42 risk of chaotic management and dissemination of erroneous information through lay  
43 networks. Second, positive influences on treatment were reported through patients,  
44 practitioners and peers working effectively together to deliver the correct information and  
45 support, which acted to normalise TB, reduce stigma and prevent misuse of TB drugs.

46 **Conclusion**

47 Effective case finding, patient support and community education strategies are essential.  
48 Patients, practitioners and peers working together can help reduce stigma and prevent  
49 misuse of TB drugs.

## 50 Introduction

51 Multidrug-resistant tuberculosis (MDR-TB) describes TB resistant to the two most powerful  
52 first-line TB drugs: rifampicin and isoniazid. MDR-TB is an emerging global problem,  
53 affecting an estimated 3.5% of new TB cases and 20.5% of retreatment cases.<sup>1</sup> Drug  
54 resistance is fuelled by many factors, including the quality of TB medications, poor  
55 adherence to treatment, ineffective treatment and retreatment regimens<sup>2,3</sup> and poor  
56 hospital infection control practices. In addition, direct access to arbitrary use of TB drugs for  
57 patients through the private market has been implicated in treatment failure and  
58 development of drug resistance in high-burden countries.<sup>4</sup> For instance, in Tbilisi, Georgia,  
59 TB drugs, including second-line agents used to treat MDR-TB, were widely available without  
60 prescription at pharmacies.<sup>5</sup> Strategies to ensure effective drug management and supply  
61 form a major component of the World Health Organisation Stop TB Strategy.<sup>6</sup> It has been  
62 concluded that policies regarding the sale and distribution of TB drugs should receive more  
63 attention in the global strategy to control drug resistance.<sup>7</sup>

64

65 Médecins Sans Frontières (MSF) has treated MDR-TB in collaboration with the Ministry of  
66 Health (MoH) in Karakalpakstan, Uzbekistan since 2003. Within the MoH National  
67 Tuberculosis Programme, treatment for drug-resistant (DR) TB, at least in the intensive  
68 phase, is most commonly delivered on an inpatient basis. Reportedly, all parts of Uzbekistan  
69 now have access to rapid molecular diagnostics and WHO-recommended treatment  
70 regimens. In Karakalpakstan, treatment is delivered in the community, with all cases directly  
71 managed by the MoH. MSF provides technical support to clinicians, psychosocial support,  
72 side-effect medications, laboratory co-ordination and additional logistic support including  
73 infection control, nutritional support and assistance with adherence strategies.

74

75 Uzbekistan has some of the highest reported rates of MDR-TB in the world, with 23% of new  
76 and 62% of retreatment TB cases identified as MDR.<sup>8</sup> Treatment for TB outside the standard  
77 National Tuberculosis Programme is known to occur, despite a national drugs policy that  
78 prohibits the selling or use of TB drugs without prescription from a TB specialist clinician or  
79 clinic.<sup>9,10</sup> We mapped all of the private and MoH-affiliated pharmacies in Karakalpakstan  
80 indicated over 400 such facilities, with evidence that in some that it was possible to

81 purchase drugs used to treat sensitive TB without prescription - most commonly isoniazid,  
82 rifampicin and streptomycin.

83

84 The Uzbekistan Government has acknowledged the need to improve the regulatory system  
85 for drug products and pharmaceutical activity.<sup>9</sup> However, Uzbekistan already has effective  
86 regulation, both in terms of policy and practice, for narcotic and psychotropic drugs. These  
87 drugs, detailed in Government-compiled lists, can be sold only under a special licence. A  
88 monthly audit is conducted, under relevant law, of medications sold against prescriptions  
89 provided to pharmacies. The Government is currently upgrading the TB drug regulation  
90 system for quality control and state registration of drugs to meet the norms and standards  
91 of the European Union and WHO. For instance, regional branches of the National Agency for  
92 Regulation of Drug Products are being established to guarantee adequate quality control.

93

94 With the present momentum for improvement of drug regulation in Uzbekistan, there is a  
95 need for better understanding of TB drug use. With the impending availability of new drugs  
96 for TB, it is essential that appropriate policies are formulated and implemented to prevent  
97 their misuse. While there is some awareness of the challenge of TB drug regulation within  
98 the MoH and the private sector, examination of local TB drug use from patient and  
99 practitioner perspectives is critical. In particular, understanding patient and practitioner  
100 beliefs, knowledge and behaviours is crucial in revising drug regulation policies.

101

102 We conducted a qualitative study to assess current policy and practice for the regulation of  
103 TB drugs in order to understand the perceptions, behaviour and experience of patients and  
104 practitioners in Karakalpakstan related to the use of TB medication. We aimed to  
105 understand and conceptualize patients' and prescribers' attitudes to TB drug prescription,  
106 TB drug-taking behaviour and the problems of TB drug regulation in a high-burden MDR-TB  
107 context.

108

## 109 **Methods**

### 110 *Research design*

111 We used a flexible participatory technique in which data were gathered from patients and  
112 practitioners using in-depth interviews guided by topic-led questions as well as field notes.  
113 Interview questions were based on themes relevant to the study aims and a literature  
114 search of studies, laws, policies and audits related to TB drug use and the role of the private  
115 market. Following standard qualitative interview procedures, the order of questions was  
116 driven by the nature of participant answers, leading to modification of the wording of  
117 questions and the order in which they were asked during interviews. The primary  
118 investigator conducting the interviews was from outside the treatment programme.

119

120 'Fair dealing', which searches for and represents participants' views as dispassionately as  
121 possible and without moral judgement, was achieved by seeking a wide range of  
122 perspectives from specialised to general practitioners within the domain of caring for  
123 people with DR-TB.<sup>11</sup> Attention to negative cases was pursued, meaning that contradictory  
124 or unexpected findings were actively sought and explored to ensure predominant themes  
125 were a true reflection of participant responses.

126

### 127 *Setting and sample*

128 The study was conducted in the joint MoH/MSF TB programme in 2012 in three  
129 administrative districts of Karakalpakstan: Nukus, Takhiatash and Hodjeley. Recruitment of  
130 24 participants (12 practitioners and 12 patients) relied on a programme manager within  
131 the country. Initial identification for recruitment was contingent on the inclusion criteria:  
132 new patients, patients who had completed treatment and chronic patients were eligible. TB  
133 specialists, non-specialist doctors and pharmacists working in the MoH, for MSF or the  
134 private system were included where possible.

135

136 A snowball technique was used for recruiting practitioners and patients to increase the  
137 uptake of participants who were difficult to reach due to communication and time  
138 limitations for public engagement with the research. A project manager/gatekeeper  
139 approached participants with an information sheet that outlined the study. Three people  
140 refused to participate, due to unavailability or unwillingness (one patient, two  
141 practitioners). Another patient agreed to participate, but did not attend the appointment

142 and was unavailable thereafter. Purposive sampling enabled recruitment of individuals with  
143 sufficient knowledge and experience of the study topic to enable development of  
144 generalised information on processes and typical patterns of meanings. Practitioner  
145 participants were mainly physicians working in the TB sector (MSF and MoH), but also  
146 general practitioners in primary health care and one MoH pharmacist. Patient participants  
147 were all DR-TB patients who had been enrolled in the national TB programme managed by  
148 MoH, in some cases with MSF support. Although a relatively small number of participants  
149 were interviewed, data collection was stopped when no new information was being  
150 generated from additional interviews.<sup>12</sup>

151

### 152 *Data collection*

153 Informed consent was sought both before and at the time of the interview using an  
154 information sheet translated into the local language (Karakalpak) stating the purpose of the  
155 study and the voluntary nature of participation. Participants additionally gave written  
156 consent on the day of their interview. Interviews were audio recorded in a private space,  
157 usually at the health facility where the practitioner worked or where the patient currently or  
158 had previously attended. All interviews were conducted with an interpreter to translate  
159 questions and responses from English to the local language. The interpreter was briefed  
160 before and after each interview to ensure the highest quality of data extraction. All  
161 interviews lasted between 45 and 60 minutes.

162

163 Although participants were able to stop their interview at any point, no-one chose to do  
164 this. Confidentiality was assured for all participants, with names of the respondents and all  
165 data referring to them being replaced by codes (D for physician, TBS for TB Specialist, PH for  
166 Pharmacist, GP for General Practitioner, and P for patient). Electronic data were password  
167 protected.

168

### 169 **Data analysis**

170 From the moment data were generated during the interviews the 'thinking and theorising'  
171 of data analysis began.<sup>13</sup> Data were managed initially through verbatim transcription of all

172 recorded conversational interviews. Silences and emotional cues (e.g. sighing, laughter) in  
173 the audio recording of the interview were noted.

174

175 Open coding of interview transcripts allowed reviewing and re-reviewing of text line by line  
176 so that the 'tagging' of words, phrases or paragraphs emerged into codes, which were  
177 constantly compared and refined revealing the experiences of the participants rather than  
178 being externally imposed.<sup>14</sup> The first author sorted codes and categories by interconnected  
179 themes or concepts<sup>13</sup> and discussed these with the second author. Codes emerged  
180 inductively; themes and categories were drawn from respondents to make 'implicit belief  
181 systems explicit in order to generate some theoretical insight'.<sup>15</sup> The decision to perform  
182 manual rather than electronic coding was partly related to the relatively small sample size  
183 and also to the value of interacting with the data in a way that promoted continuous  
184 refinement of interpretations and deeper understanding.<sup>13</sup>

185

186 Participant validation involved 10% of each participant's coded interview transcript chosen  
187 at random being checked by them, to ensure that the researcher's documentation and  
188 analysis were not disputed. Researcher reflexivity and awareness of the potential for  
189 'personal or intellectual biases' were exercised<sup>16</sup> together with use of field notes and  
190 relevant literature.

191

## 192 **Ethics**

193 Ethics approval was granted by the MSF Ethics Review Board and the Bioethics Commission  
194 of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Uzbekistan.

195

## 196 **Results**

197 The response rate was 86%. Participant age ranged from 22 to 60 years, with equal numbers  
198 of men and women. Table 1 describes the characteristics of participants.

199

200 We present the main findings by negative and positive influences on TB treatment. Both  
201 influences highlighted the likelihood of incorrect use of TB drugs and the potential to prevent

202 self-administration or poor management of TB. We illustrate our findings through  
203 participants' quotes (Boxes 1 and 2).

204

### 205 **Negative influences on TB treatment**

206 Negative influences encompass the factors that increased the likelihood of self-treatment,  
207 incorrect use, and chaotic management of TB drugs. Key among these influences were shame  
208 and stigma, and incorrect lay knowledge.

209

#### 210 *Shame and stigma*

211 The shame and stigma that patients felt in having TB was a major contributor to the risk of  
212 incorrect treatment. Nearly all participants, both professional and patient, referred to these  
213 concepts as incentives for people infected with TB to seek self-treatment in order to avoid  
214 disclosing their status (Box 1, quotes 1, 2).

215

216 Feelings of shame and stigma were also found to lead to chaotic management of TB  
217 treatment by patients, general practitioners and more widely in primary care; a point  
218 stressed by patients and practitioners. Participants differentiated between self-medication  
219 of TB drugs and mismanagement of these drugs by doctors or radiologists working outside  
220 the official TB programme; however, all participants associated a lack of knowledge about  
221 effective treatment of TB with the chaotic management of patient care (Box 1, quote 3). For  
222 patients, poor management by practitioners was the predominant issue (Box 1, quote 4). Of  
223 note, where patients were already in the official treatment programme, interruption of  
224 treatment due to side effects or quality of care was not seen as a risk factor for seeking  
225 alternative TB drugs, especially where disillusionment from drug side effects was the main  
226 reason for a treatment break. Instead, the inclination at this stage was towards seeking  
227 traditional healing options such as ingestion of dog fat or remedies from traditional healers  
228 (Box 1, quote 5).

229

#### 230 *Incorrect lay knowledge*

231 The second factor influencing patients' tendency to seek treatment outside the TB control  
232 programme involved what could be termed as incorrect lay knowledge. Information conveyed

233 through a neighbour, relative or lay community network during collective events such as  
234 weddings or funerals was perceived by patients as instrumental in the proliferation of  
235 incorrect advice on treatment for TB. Such information was implicated in decisions to seek  
236 treatment outside the TB programme, especially where lay networks indicated a quicker  
237 treatment solution was available (Box 1, quotes 6, 7).

238

239 Risk of self-medication was highest prior to referral or entry to the TB programme. While  
240 access to TB drugs was prevalent, common knowledge about drugs specifically used to treat  
241 tuberculosis resistant to first-line therapy was limited.

242

243 In terms of common knowledge, most patient participants demonstrated familiarity with  
244 the drugs used to treat sensitive TB as opposed to TB resistant to first-line treatment (Box 1,  
245 quote 8). Doctor and patient participants referred to the easy availability of TB drugs as a  
246 factor contributing to self-medication (Box 1, quotes 9, 10). The availability of TB drugs  
247 outside the TB programme and incorrect lay knowledge about TB treatment, coupled with  
248 shame and stigma surrounding TB, have a bearing on developing policy towards regulation  
249 of TB drugs.

250

### 251 **Positive influences on TB treatment**

252 Positive influences on TB treatment highlight how the correct information and support,  
253 communicated between patients, practitioners and peers working together effectively, and  
254 with strong policy support, can contribute to increasing familiarity with TB. This strengthens  
255 beliefs in the treatment as a cure, reduces stigma, and prevents misuse of TB drugs.

256

#### 257 *Knowledge and belief about successful treatment*

258 In terms of overcoming chaotic management of treatment, all respondents suggested  
259 knowledge of successful TB treatment to be a key factor. This was noted not only in terms of  
260 understanding the association between treatment and cure from a doctor-patient  
261 perspective, but also in the context of good communication between specialists and general  
262 practitioners contributing to better management of treatment regimens for TB (Box 2, quote  
263 1). All participants referred to entry to the TB programme as helping prevent self-medication.

264 Once a patient had entered the treatment programme, the availability of free drugs,  
265 perceived as high quality and giving good results, was a positive feature for all participants  
266 (Box 2, quote 2,3). Both patient and practitioner insights on the control of TB treatment  
267 described easy access to medicines and the supply of formal treatment as essential to  
268 stopping self-medication.

269

270 Other predominant ideas from patients and practitioners were associated with treatment  
271 compliance and understanding the strength of the drugs used to treat DR-TB. Ways to ease  
272 the side effects of TB drugs described by patients were presented as means of enduring  
273 treatment, indicating that peer support can increase patient awareness of the importance of  
274 completing treatment (Box 2, quote 4). Seeing positive outcomes arise through treatment  
275 completion and cure strengthened patients' belief in treatment. In particular, the relationship  
276 between knowledge, belief in treatment and communicating completion of treatment and  
277 cure was stressed. One patient highlighted the education that the programme could offer  
278 through 'seeing' the disease; for example, the value of seeing the X-ray used as part of  
279 diagnosis (Box 2, quote 5).

280

### 281 *Health practitioner, peer, and policy support*

282 All respondents stressed the value of communication and doctor-patient support as a  
283 safeguard against alternative hidden treatments. There was evidence that this patient-  
284 centred approach built up the necessary confidence, trust and motivation for patients to  
285 continue with appropriate treatment regimens (Box 2, quote 6). Peer support, involving  
286 sharing knowledge, experience and encouragement, was presented as valuable and part of  
287 patient solidarity. Of note, this support was not reported to have reached the home; instead  
288 the place where treatment was carried out was conceptualised as the place of sanctity for  
289 patients (Box 2, quote 7). Peer support and patients' drive to overcome the difficult treatment  
290 emerged as potentially able to normalise TB. These factors should be nurtured as key  
291 components in patient-centred care, alongside effective case finding, tailored treatment and  
292 adherence.

293

294 On the question of better administrative, institutional and legal controls over the regulation  
295 of TB drug use, political leadership toward directives for more stringent control for specific TB  
296 drugs was indicated (Box 2 quote 8).

297

298 In relation to indicators for effective treatment, the predominant ideas and majority themes  
299 found in both patient and practitioner responses showed that patients were more likely to  
300 perceive treatment as effective if they were correctly educated about the merit of TB drugs  
301 and experienced the benefits of completion of treatment. This in turn was seen to endorse  
302 the value of the TB programme. Alongside the 'test and treat' health education message,  
303 'complete and cure' was seen as equally necessary.

304

### 305 **Discussion**

306 Patients reported misuse of TB drugs to be most likely at the initial stage of their sickness  
307 and treatment journey. Motivated by the shame of having TB and the inherent social  
308 stigma, patients chose to hide their condition by resorting to drug-treatment options  
309 outside the National TB Programme.<sup>17</sup> Self-treatment appeared less likely once patients had  
310 engaged with the programme, underlining the need for a strong case-finding component in  
311 the TB treatment approach. Finding patients and initiating correct diagnosis and treatment  
312 is critical to preventing a default to self-treatment and for promoting a successful outcome.  
313 Interruption of treatment was not a risk factor for seeking alternative TB drugs, but did  
314 initiate the use of alternative traditional treatments. Chaotic management of TB care was  
315 reported to be connected to instances where the primary care practitioner was presented  
316 with cases they did not know how best to treat.

317

318 The value of a treatment programme characterised by free, accessible and supportive patient-  
319 centred care was evident as an important determinant for sustaining effective treatment. As  
320 previously reported through studies looking at patient-centred care as positive for effective  
321 treatment, our findings support focus on the patient as key to maintaining good treatment  
322 practice both for primary care doctors involved in the TB programme and patients engaged  
323 in taking effective TB treatment.<sup>18</sup> Likewise, doctor-patient trust and support were deemed  
324 significant in preventing misuse of drugs and therefore contributed to adherence.<sup>19</sup> In

325 particular, Fiscella et al established that physicians' verbal behaviour during a doctor-patient  
326 encounter was associated with trust by both practitioners and patients.<sup>20</sup>

327

328 As supported by a growing body of evidence,<sup>21</sup> patients saw peer support and belief in  
329 treatment as vital components of the TB programme. The next challenge is to extend this  
330 support and the positive experience of TB treatment to the home and community  
331 environments. This effort should involve targeted community sensitisation and supervised  
332 home-based treatment where indicated,<sup>22,23</sup> in particular where social gatherings enable the  
333 transmission of incorrect knowledge.<sup>24</sup>

334 Knowledge about TB and treatment should be an important component of future drug  
335 regulation strategies.<sup>25</sup> The effective dissemination of correct knowledge can catalyse  
336 change. It is apparent that poor knowledge and a sense that cure is difficult or that  
337 treatment can fail can lead to stigma and non-disclosure of infection.<sup>26</sup> Therefore, the  
338 communication of correct knowledge and understanding between patients, between  
339 patients and their doctors, and between doctors is essential for uptake and completion of  
340 effective TB treatment.<sup>27</sup>

341

342 Knowledge of and access to drugs used to treat sensitive TB in the private market was  
343 confirmed as a result of pharmacy audit exercise and patient knowledge drawn from the in-  
344 depth interviews. However, drugs used predominantly to treat TB resistant to first-line  
345 drugs were not as available or as well known by patients. Political leadership is an essential  
346 consideration of the new policy development towards successful TB drug control, especially  
347 in light of new drugs in the TB treatment pipeline.<sup>28</sup> The Panel shows policy  
348 recommendations that we have drawn from our research.

349

### 350 *Limitations*

351 Due to some patients' experience of the benefits of treatment, the potential for them to  
352 present only a very positive account has been considered in terms of objectivity from the  
353 standpoint of cure. However, patients' potential to articulate and draw on life stories related  
354 to a general engagement with treatment was well suited to the aims of the research. While  
355 the response rate was good, it is acknowledged that participants approached may have been

356 those easier to access by programme staff. The reason for participant refusal was linked to  
357 time availability and general doubts about the research. Even though private practitioners  
358 were not interviewed, insights into private and public health practices were seen through the  
359 perspective of all interviewees.

360

361 Participants may give responses that they think the researcher is hoping to hear; however,  
362 for this study, the researcher was sufficiently distanced from the programme to counter this  
363 effect. The study design could be seen as offering a unique chance for participants to  
364 express their views and tell their stories to an outsider who had no responsibility in the  
365 programme. As is characteristic of qualitative research, the data cannot be generalized to  
366 the population but transferability to other research findings can apply.

367

### 368 **Conclusions**

369 This study was stimulated by practitioners' anecdotal evidence that misuse of TB drugs was  
370 prolific through self-medication and regimen mismanagement. Our findings highlight the  
371 risks for TB drug misuse and the opportunities for prevention and reinforce the need for  
372 political engagement with the public and private sector.

373

374 Stigma and shame and the desire for patients to seek treatment elsewhere should be  
375 addressed by inclusion of case finding and community education strategies in programming.  
376 A patient-centred treatment approach to TB achieves this aim and is thus as important as  
377 the administrative regulation of drug treatment regimens. A decentralised treatment  
378 approach with stringent controls is the best solution for TB drug regulation. As first-line TB  
379 drugs are perceived as more misused than second-line drugs, stringent regulation of these  
380 drugs is a feasible and urgent next step.

381

### 382 **Acknowledgments**

383 We thank Sarah Venis (medical editor MSF UK) for editing assistance, Yesemurat Kalniyazov  
384 for translation and the MSF/MoH project teams for their assistance in Karakalpakstan and  
385 Tashkent, Uzbekistan.

386

387 **Funding**

388 There was no specific funding for this research.

389

390 **Conflicts of interest**

391 None declared.

392

393 **Author contributions**

394 BS wrote the protocol, conducted the fieldwork, analysed the data and wrote the first draft  
395 of the manuscript.

396 KL supported protocol, analysed data and reviewed and revised the manuscript

397 MT reviewed manuscript

398 PN reviewed manuscript

399 DU reviewed manuscript

400 PdC supported protocol design and reviewed manuscript

401 EH reviewed manuscript

402 NS supported policy analysis and reviewed the manuscript

403 All authors have seen and approved the final version of the manuscript.

404 **Table 1: Participant characteristics**

Participant characteristic	Number of participants
General practitioner (GP)	2
TB specialist (TBS)	9
Pharmacist	1
Drug-resistant TB patients	
- New patients	6
- Chronic patients	4
- Completed treatment	2

405

406

407 **Box 1. Negative influences: Illustrative quotes from participants**

408 **Shame, stigma and chaotic management**

409 *D1 (TBS) – 1. Then we have stigma meaning that it is a very bad form stigma means not telling*  
410 *others you have TB or getting treatment somewhere.*

411 *P11 – 2. There are for example people of higher social levels they don't want to go to hospitals*  
412 *they prefer hidden treatment when they buy drugs at pharmacies they do it secretly.*

413 **Chaotic management by practitioners and patients**

414 *D7 (TBS) – 3. I visit polyclinics and show [the general practitioners] their mistakes; they still*  
415 *repeat them when I next visit them. It means, that people do not feel themselves responsible.*

416 *P12 – 4. When I contacted a doctor he said I got a bit cold. This and that, it had adhered to*  
417 *your lungs, it is enough to take these and those injections, but I couldn't get the full treatment.*

418 *P7 – 5. People say to go to a sorceress. If they believe them they may do this or that. It easier*  
419 *than taking drugs, that's why they prefer that way. People always seek easier ways. That's*  
420 *why they stop the drugs and go to them.*

421 **Incorrect knowledge**

422 *D6 (TBS) – 6. And if we talk about those who self-medicate from pharmacy, they usually say*  
423 *"my neighbour had TB and I get the same treatment from them, or a relative had TB, or*  
424 *someone at home".*

425 *D1 (TBS) – 7. They take without prescription, because they go to some events like funerals,*  
426 *weddings, that time they may hear "I got cough, and tried this drug". Says he/she got tubazide*  
427 *[proprietary name for isoniazid], isoniazid [TB drug used in standard regimen] and advises*  
428 *them to others. Do you get me? They gather together during these events. They say "I have*  
429 *cough", "your cough is very bad", "a man in a drugstore told me, advised me, I got this and*  
430 *got cured".*

431 *PH 10– 8. At pharmacies? Many drugstores sell ethambutol, rifampicin is easily available,*  
432 *isoniazid, and I think it's only pyrazinamide which is not delivered.*

433 *D10 (TBS) – 9. Yes, yes, yes, free availability sometimes they disappear for example*  
434 *pharmaceutical companies don't have them sometimes it happens and it is difficult to find*  
435 *them in drugstores and their prices increase now they are available yes available.*

436 *D4 (TBS) – 10. Well it's up to the patient because if the patient says "I will take I will find" he*  
437 *may do this.*

438 **Box 2. Positive influences: Illustrative quotes from participants**

439 **Knowledge about successful treatment**

440 *D1 (TBS) – 1. We should work together with GPs... We should make it better in polyclinics and*  
 441 *work with, umm other specialist, neurologists, with surgeons.*

442 *P5 – 2. I wake up in the morning, thank God that I am good, and recently we started adding*  
 443 *words like “when I finish the programme I will be healthy”. We live with these thoughts, with*  
 444 *the idea that the treatment will have good effect on us.*

445 *P11 – 3. These drugs are very good! If you take them you will be cured, I believe in their power*  
 446 *when they told me they would treat me ...I agreed despite all the difficulties.*

447 *P5 – 4. We see the results of the quality. We are getting better thanks to these drugs.*  
 448 *We...ummm...how to say it...I...umm...we, women here are taking drugs together and ...ummm*  
 449 *we talk to each other having no secrets.*

450 *P1 – 5. But I have a strong belief in these drugs, the quality, the strength; I saw a picture of my*  
 451 *lung I got happy. I believe in the effect of these drugs.*

452 **Health practitioner, peer and policy support**

453 *D7 (TBS) – 6. A doctor should pay much attention and time to the patient; I mean patient*  
 454 *should see that not only his family wants him to recover but doctors too. Only this kind of*  
 455 *attitude may help get him cured ... if a doctor loses a patient’s trust, patient will not give him*  
 456 *even a chance to treat.*

457 *P6- 7. There have been many of them having problems at home, when they don’t have peace*  
 458 *at home, they can’t take them at home, I can easily be a friend to anyone – we take drugs*  
 459 *together here.*

460 *D5 (TBS) – 8. To prevent this... to stop selling, we need to add...include to our work the*  
 461 *Ministry of Health, the Cabinet of ministers, tax committee, customs, Government. If the*  
 462 *ministry, tax committee and customs agree to join you this will be successful, fines will be*  
 463 *enough for others to stop selling.*

- Political influence should be exercised by the relevant Government Ministries and WHO for more stringent control for specific TB drugs. Engagement between the public and private sector for this purpose is essential.
- A free, patient-centred TB treatment approach is equally important for effective regulation.
- The system of drug regulation for narcotic and psychotropic drugs in Uzbekistan should be adapted for TB drugs, especially for those that are vital for the treatment of drug-resistant TB.
- Effective case finding, community education and patient support strategies should be included in programming to diminish the problem of shame and the desire for patients to seek treatment elsewhere.
- Development of training and education programmes aimed at increasing clear guidance to general health practitioners: i.e. doctors, pharmacists and radiologists.
- Inclusion of peer support within national TB programme strategies to enhance shared experience of TB treatment and cure.

465 **References**

- 
- <sup>1</sup> WHO. Multidrug-resistant tuberculosis (MDR-TB): 2014 update. [http://www.who.int/tb/challenges/mdr/mdr\\_tb\\_factsheet.pdf?ua=1](http://www.who.int/tb/challenges/mdr/mdr_tb_factsheet.pdf?ua=1) (accessed Feb 4, 2015).
- <sup>2</sup> Furin JJ, Becerra MC, Shin SS, Kim JY, Bayona J, Farmer PE. Effect of administering short-course, standardized regimens in individuals infected with drug-resistant *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* strains. *Eur J Clin Microbiol Infect Dis* 2000;19:132–136.
- <sup>3</sup> Seung KJ, Gelmanova IE, Peremitin GG, *et al.* The Effect of Initial Drug Resistance on Treatment Response and Acquired Drug Resistance during Standardized Short-Course Chemotherapy for Tuberculosis. *Clin Infect Dis* 2004; **39**: 1321–8.
- <sup>4</sup> Wells WA, Ge CF, Patel N, Oh T, Gardiner E, Kimerling ME. Size and Usage Patterns of Private TB Drug Markets in the High Burden Countries. *PLoS ONE* 2011; **6**: e18964.
- <sup>5</sup> Kobaidze K, Salakaia A, Blumberg HM. Over the Counter Availability of Antituberculosis Drugs in Tbilisi, Georgia in the Setting of a High Prevalence of MDR-TB. *Interdiscip Perspect Infect Dis* 2009; **2009**: e513609.

- <sup>6</sup> WHO. The Stop TB Strategy. WHO. [http://www.who.int/tb/strategy/stop\\_tb\\_strategy/en/](http://www.who.int/tb/strategy/stop_tb_strategy/en/) (accessed Feb 4, 2015).
- <sup>7</sup> Paydar A, Mak A, Al Jahdali H, *et al.* Global survey of national tuberculosis drug policies. *Int J Tuberc Lung Dis* 2011; **15**: 613–9.
- <sup>8</sup> World Health Organization. Global tuberculosis report 2014. Geneva: World Health Organization, 2014.
- <sup>9</sup> National Drug Policy, 1999. Republic of Uzbekistan. <http://www.gov.uz/en/authorities/ministries/1303> (accessed Feb 19, 2015).
- <sup>10</sup> Ministry of Healthcare of Uzbekistan. On Enhancement of the TB Service in the Republic of Uzbekistan. Article 6, Prikaz №160, April 3, 2003.
- <sup>11</sup> Dingwall R. Don't mind him - he's from Barcelona: qualitative methods in health studies. In: Daly J, McDonald I, Willis E, eds. *Researching health care*. London: Routledge, 1992: 161-175.
- <sup>12</sup> Green J, Thorogood N. *Qualitative Methods for Health Research*. SAGE Publications, 2004.
- <sup>13</sup> Basit TN. Manual or electronic? The role of coding in qualitative data analysis. *Educ Res* 2003; **45**: 143–54.
- <sup>14</sup> Bradley EH, Curry LA, Devers KJ. Qualitative Data Analysis for Health Services Research: Developing Taxonomy, Themes, and Theory. *Health Serv Res* 2007; **42**: 1758–72.
- <sup>15</sup> Borgalti, S. 1996. Introduction to Grounded Theory. <http://www.analytictech.com/mb870/introtogt.htm> (accessed Feb 4, 2015).
- <sup>16</sup> Mays N, Pope C. Assessing quality in qualitative research. *BMJ* 2000; **320**: 50–2.
- <sup>17</sup> Courtwright A, Turner A. 2010. Tuberculosis and stigmatisation: pathways and interventions. *Public Health Reports*. 125 (suppl 4) 34-42.
- <sup>18</sup> Lewis CP, Newell JN. Improving tuberculosis care in low income countries – a qualitative study of patients' understanding of "patient support" in Nepal. *BMC Public Health* 2009; **9**:190.
- <sup>19</sup> Munro SA, Lewin SA, Smith HJ, Engel ME, Fretheim A, *et al.* Patient Adherence to Tuberculosis Treatment: A Systematic Review of Qualitative Research. *PLoS Med* 2007; **4**: e238. doi:10.1371/journal.pmed.0040238.
- <sup>20</sup> Fiscella K. Patient Trust: Is It Related to Patient-Centered Behavior of Primary Care Physicians? *Medical Care* 2004; **42**:11.
- <sup>21</sup> Macq J, Torfoss T, Getahun H. Patient empowerment in tuberculosis control: reflecting on past documented experiences. *Trop Med Int Health* 2007; **12**: 873–885.
- <sup>22</sup> Dolinar RM, Kumar V, Coutu-Wakulczyk G, Rowe BH. Pilot study of a home-based asthma health education program. *Patient Educ Couns* 2000; **40**:93-102.
- <sup>23</sup> Roy A, Abubakar I, Chapman A, *et al.* A Controlled Trial of the Knowledge Impact of Tuberculosis Information Leaflets among Staff Supporting Substance Misusers: Pilot Study. *PLoS ONE* 2011; **6**: e20875.
- <sup>24</sup> Berkman LF, Glass T, Brissette I, Seeman TE. From Social Integration to Health: Durkheim in the New Millenium. *Soc Sci Med* 2000; **51**:843-857.
- <sup>25</sup> Fatiregun AA, Ojo AS, Bamgboye AE. Treatment outcomes among pulmonary tuberculosis patients at treatment centers in Ibadan, Nigeria. *Ann Afr Med* 2009; **8**:100-104.
- <sup>26</sup> Macq J, Solis A, Martinez G, Martiny P. Tackling tuberculosis patients' internalized social stigma through patient centred care: An intervention study in rural Nicaragua. *BMC Public Health* 2008; **8**:154.

---

<sup>27</sup> Wandwalo ER, Mørkve O. Knowledge of disease and treatment among tuberculosis patients in Mwanza, Tanzania. *Int J Tuberc Lung Dis* 2000; 4:11.

<sup>28</sup> Abubakar I, Zignol M, Falzon D, et al. Drug-resistant tuberculosis: time for visionary political leadership. *Lancet Infect Dis* 2013; 13:529-39.